

SCIENCE BENCH BOOK FOR JUDGES
TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION: WHY THIS BENCH BOOK? 1

2. WHAT IS SCIENCE? 5

2.1 Introduction 6

2.2 The Scientific Method 8

2.3 The Peer Review Process 9

2.4 The Myth of Scientific Objectivity 10

2.5 Science is Acquiring Knowledge 12

3. SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE 13

3.1 Introduction 14

3.2 Opinion Evidence: The General Rule 15

3.3 Scientific Evidence as Opinion Evidence 16

3.4 What Distinguishes Scientific and Technical Evidence 18

3.5 Expert Opinion 19

**3.6 Distinguishing Expert Scientific Opinion from Other
 Expert Opinion 20**

3.7 Legal vs. Scientific Standards 21

3.8 Cyber and Digital Evidence 22

3.9 Endnotes 27

3.10 Forensic Pattern Evidence 29

 3.10.1 Introduction 30

 3.10.2 Firearms/Tool Marks 33

 3.10.3 Questioned Documents (Including Handwriting,
 Ink, Ink Marks) 36

3.10.4	Trace Evidence	38
3.10.5	Biological/Serology Screening (Hair, Fingernails, Blood Type, Etc.)	40
3.10.6	Impression Evidence (Footwear, Tire Impressions, Bitemarks, Fingerprints)	45
3.10.7	Blood Pattern Evidence	52
3.10.8	Shaken Baby Syndrome	54
3.10.9	A Sampling of Cases on Scientific Evidence	57
3.10.10	Endnotes	69
3.11	Forensic Analytical Evidence	77
3.11.1	Introduction	78
3.11.2	Toxicology	80
3.11.3	Fiber analysis	85
3.11.4	Medico-Legal Death Investigation	86
3.11.5	Fire Debris / Arson, Explosion Analysis	88
3.11.6	Practice Pointers For Trial Judges	89
3.11.7	A Sampling of Cases on Scientific Evidence	89
3.11.8	Endnotes	91
3.12	DNA Evidence	95
3.12.1	Introduction	96
3.12.2	DNA Databases	102
3.12.3	Fourth Amendment Issues	105
3.12.4	Procedural Issues	110
3.12.5	Discovery Issues	112
3.12.6	Admissibility Issues	116
3.12.7	Endnotes	120

4. INTRODUCTION TO RESEARCH TERMINOLOGY AND CONCEPTS 131

4.1 Introduction..... 132



4.2	Statistics	133
4.3	Data	134
4.4	Variables	136
4.5	Hypotheses	137
4.6	Populations and Samples	138
4.7	Types of Studies	139
4.7.1	Observational Studies	139
4.7.2	Correlational Studies.....	143
4.7.3	Experimental Studies	148
4.8	Validity and Reliability	151
4.9	Hypothesis Testing	156
4.10	Statistical Significance	160
4.11	Probability	162
4.11.1	Frequentist Probability.....	162
4.11.2	Conditional Probability	162
4.11.3	Bayes’ Probability	164
4.12	Misleading or Inaccurate Reports	168
4.12.1	Misleading Charts & Graphs	170
4.12.2	No Baseline	170
4.12.3	Missing or Incomplete Data	171
4.12.4	Numbers Don’t Add Up.....	172
4.12.5	Review - Analyzing Expert Reports	173
4.13	Endnotes	175
5.	PRE-TRIAL CIVIL	179
5.1	Introduction	180
5.2	Pre-Trial Discovery of an Expert	183
5.2.1	An Expert’s Report	184
5.2.2.	Ghost Writers.....	184

5.3	Judge’s Role as a Gatekeeper in Pre-Trial Proceedings.....	186
5.4	Judicial Research on Non-Legal Matters, Scientific or Technical	191
5.5	Conclusion	194
5.6	Endnotes	196
6.	PRE-TRIAL CRIMINAL.....	201
6.1	Pre-Trial Supervision	201
6.1.1	Introduction	202
6.1.2	Location Monitoring Technology	202
6.1.3	Substance Use Monitoring	203
6.1.4	Risk Assessment Tool.....	205
6.1.5	Endnotes.....	206
6.2	Pre-Trial Discovery.....	207
6.2.1	Introduction	208
6.2.2	General	208
6.2.3	Timing of Statutory or Court Rule Discovery Motions.....	210
6.2.4	Types of Statutory or Court Rule Discovery Provided.....	211
6.2.5	Protective Order.....	214
6.2.6	Continuing Duty to Disclose	214
6.2.7	Endnotes	215
7.	TRIAL	217
7.1	Introduction.....	218
7.2	The History of The Judicial Gatekeeper Function.....	219
7.2.1	<i>Frye v. United States</i>	219
7.2.2	Federal Rule of Evidence 702 (1975-2000)	221

7.2.3	The <i>Daubert</i> Trilogy.....	221
7.2.4	Federal Rule of Evidence 702 (2000-Present).....	225
7.2.5	<i>Frye vs. Daubert: A Summary Comparison</i>	225
7.3	Evaluating Admissibility of Expert Evidence and Scientific Evidence	227
7.3.1.	Legal Issues.	227
7.3.2	Procedural Issues	228
7.3.3	Specific Factors for The Trial Judge To Consider ...	230
7.4	Admissibility vs. Weight	235
7.5	Endnotes	237
8.	JUVENILE COURT	243
8.1	The Use of Science in Juvenile Court	244
8.1.1	Introduction	244
8.1.2	The Science of Non Verbal Cues in Infants	245
8.1.3	Understanding Attachment Theory	246
8.1.4	The “Still Face” Effect	247
8.1.5	Informed Decision-making	248
8.1.6	The Necessity for Evidence Based Interventions in Child Welfare	249
8.2	Core Concepts of Human Development.....	252
8.3	Valuable Resources	254
8.4	Endnotes	255
9.	THE EXPERT WITNESS	259
9.1	Foundation for Expert Witness Testimony	260
9.1.1	Inclusion or Exclusion: A Judgment Call	260
9.1.2	Limiting Testimony: Another Alternative	261
9.1.3	General Rules of Admissibility	262

9.2	The Ethics, Duties and Responsibilities of Expert Witnesses	263
9.2.1	Progress Towards a National Standard of Ethics	264
9.2.2	Ethical Violations	265
9.3	The Independence and Impartiality of Experts	
	General Principles	267
9.4	Stating Facts or Assumptions, And Considering All Material Facts	268
9.5	Red Flags: Lack of Objectivity / Impartiality	270
9.6	Knowledge Outside Witness’s Expertise	273
9.7	Five Things Judges Should Know About Experts	274
9.8	Endnotes	275
10.	EVIDENCE-BASED SENTENCING	277
10.1	Introduction	278
10.2	What Does Evidence-Based Sentencing Involve?	280
10.2.1	Conducting validated risk, needs, and responsivity assessments of the defendant	280
10.2.2	Risk/Needs Assessment	280
10.2.3	Provide assessment results to the court	282
10.2.4	Use assessment results to inform sentencing decisions about community supervision, treatment, and other services for the offender	283
10.3	Does <i>Daubert</i> (or <i>Frye</i>) Apply to Evidenced-Based Sentencing?	285
10.4	Endnotes	286
11.	POST SENTENCING SUPERVISION	289
11.1	Introduction	290



11.2 Electronic Tracking Devices 291

11.3 Digital Monitoring 295

11.4 Biometrics 299

11.5 Automated Supervision 300

11.6 Alcohol and Other Drug Testing 304

 11.6.1 Urine 305

 11.6.2 Breath 309

 11.6.3 Oral Fluids 310

 11.6.4 Sweat Patches 311

 11.6.5 Transdermal Ankle Bracelets 312

 11.6.6 Hair/Nails 312

 11.6.7 Blood 313

11.7 Attempts to Defraud the Test 314

11.8 In the Courtroom 315

11.9 Constitutional and Legal Considerations 317

11.10 Conclusion 320

11.11 Endnotes 321

12. CIVIL POST TRIAL PROCEEDINGS 335

12.1 Offering New Scientific Evidence Post Judgment 336

12.2 Civil Commitments of Sexually Violent Predators 339

12.3 Conclusion 343

12.4 Endnotes 344

**13. CONCLUSION: JUDGES—THE GATEKEEPERS OF
SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE 347**



APPENDIX 1 351

Frye/Daubert—State-by-State

APPENDIX 2 369

Sample Orders for Criminal Discovery

APPENDIX 3 397

Biographies

